CITY OF BOULDER LANDMARKS BOARD

May 7, 2014

1777 Broadway, Council Chambers Room 6 p.m.

The following are the action minutes of the May 7, 2014 City of Boulder Landmarks Board meeting. A digital recording and a permanent set of these minutes (maintained for a period of seven years) are retained in Central Records (telephone: 303-441-3043). You may also listen to the recording on-line at: www.boulderplandevelop.net.

BOARD MEMBERS:

Mark Gerwing, Chair Kirsten Snobeck Nick Fiore Kate Remley Mike Schreiner

*Leonard May *Planning Board representative without a vote

STAFF MEMBERS:

Hella Pannewig, Senior Assistant City Attorney James Hewat, Senior Historic Preservation Planner Marcy Cameron, Historic Preservation Planner Lesli Ellis, Comprehensive Planning Manager Angela Smelker, Historic Preservation Intern

1. CALL TO ORDER

The roll having been called, Chair **M. Gerwing** declared a quorum at 6:02 p.m. and the following business was conducted.

2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

On a motion by **M. Gerwing**, seconded by **K. Snobeck**, the Landmarks Board approved (5-0) the minutes as amended of the April 2, 2014 board meeting.

3. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION FOR ITEMS NOT ON THE AGENDA

4. DISCUSSION OF LANDMARK ALTERATION AND DEMOLITION APPLICATIONS ISSUED AND PENDING

- 640 Hawthorn Ave.
- Statistical Report

5. ACTION ITEMS

A. Public hearing and consideration of an application to designate the building and property at 2104 Bluff St. as a local historic landmark, to be known as the Kelso House, per Section 9-11-5 of the Boulder Revised Code, 1981 (HIS2014-00048). Applicant/Owner: Chad and Kristen Watson.

Staff Presentation

M. Cameron made a presentation with recommending that the Landmarks Board forward the application to City Council with a recommendation to designate the property as a local landmark.

Applicant's Presentation

The applicant was not in attendance.

Public Hearing

Abby Daniels, 1123 Spruce St., Executive Director of Historic Boulder, spoke in support of landmark designation for the Kelso House, noting the organization's history with the property.

Motion

On a motion by **M. Gerwing**, seconded by **K. Snobeck**, the Landmarks Board adopted (5-0) a resolution to initiate landmark designation the property at 2104 Bluff St. as a local historic landmark, to be known as the Kelso House, finding that it meets the standards for individual landmark designation in Sections 9-11-1 and 9-11-2, B.R.C. 1981, and adopts the staff memorandum, including the following as the findings of the board:

The Landmarks Board finds that, based upon the application and evidence presented and subject to the conditions of approval, the proposed designation application will be consistent with the purposes and standards of the Historic Preservation Ordinance, and

- 1. The proposed designation will protect, enhance, and perpetuate a building reminiscent of past eras and persons important in local and state history and provide a significant example of architecture from the past. Sec. 9-11-1(a), B.R.C. 1981.
- 2. The proposed designation will maintain an appropriate setting and environment and will enhance property values, stabilize the neighborhood, promote tourist trade and interest, and foster knowledge of the city's living heritage. 9-11-1(a), B.R.C. 1981.
- 3. The proposed designation draws a reasonable balance between private property rights and the public interest in preserving the city's cultural, historic, and architectural heritage by ensuring that demolition of buildings important to that heritage will be carefully weighed with other alternatives. 9-11-1(b), B.R.C. 1981.
- 4. The proposed designation is consistent with the criteria specified in Section 9-11-5(c), B.R.C. 1981.

B. Public hearing and consideration of whether to initiate individual landmark designation for the property located at 640 Hawthorn Ave., per Section 9-11-3 of the Boulder Revised Code, 1981 (HIS2014-00033). Owner: Orion and Kristin Creamer.

Board members were asked to reveal any ex-parte contacts they may have had on this item.

- L. May recused himself.
- **M. Schreiner** drove by the property.
- **M. Gerwing** and **K. Remley** made site visits on April 16, 2014 and attended the April 24, 2014 meeting with the applicant to discuss alternatives.
- **K. Snobeck** attended the Landmarks design review committee meeting when the application was referred to the board and made a site visit on April 16, 2014.
- **N. Fiore** made a site visit prior to the April 2, 2014 Landmarks Board meeting.

Staff Presentation

M. Cameron made a presentation and noting that staff did not have a recommendation for board action.

Applicant's Presentation

Kristin Creamer, 650 Hawthorn Ave., property owner, requested the board issue a demolition permit for the two buildings.

Public Hearing

Abby Daniels, 1123 Spruce St., Executive Director of Historic Boulder, expressed support of initiating landmark designation for the property to allow for more public feedback.

Motion

The board agreed not to take action on the application and continue the stay of demolition at the current time to provide more time to seek alternatives to the demolition of the buildings at 640 Hawthorn Ave.

C. Public hearing and consideration of a Landmark Alteration Certificate to remove a 1920s addition and construct a 1,530 sq. ft. addition at the rear of the house at 835 Pine St. in the Mapleton Hill Historic District, per section 9-11-18 of the Boulder Revised Code (HIS2014-00058). Applicant: Keith Berger Owner: Jennifer Sullivan.

Board members were asked to reveal any ex-parte contacts they may have had on this item.

- M. Gerwing, K. Snobeck, K. Remley and N. Fiore made site visits.
- **K. Snobeck** reviewed the project at the Landmarks design review committee meeting.
- M. Schreiner and L. May had no ex-parte contacts.

Staff Presentation

J. Hewat made a PowerPoint presentation to the board and recommended that the Landmark Alteration Certificate application be approved with conditions.

Applicant's Presentation

Jennifer Sullivan, 835 Pine St., spoke in support of the Landmark Alteration Certificate. **Keith Berger**, 2035 Alpine Dr., spoke in support of the Landmark Alteration Certificate.

Public Hearing

Kathryn Barth, 2940 20th St., spoke in opposition of an addition that doubles the square footage of a house and considers the addition to be more complicated. Considers mass and scale and perhaps square footage should be reduced as the current proposal overpowers the original portion of the house.

Abby Daniels, 1123 Spruce St., noted that the Preservation Committee agrees with the staff recommendation.

J. Sullivan clarified that they were aware of the design guidelines when they purchased the house and considered the lot to have low visibility from the street.

K. Berger noted that the main bulk is 75' back from the street and that the lot slopes up and will help to reduce the visibility of the addition.

Motion

On a motion by **M. Gerwing**, seconded by **K. Snobeck**, the Landmarks Board approved (4-1, **K. Remley** objecting) the staff memorandum dated May 7, 2014 as the findings of the board and approves the removal of the c. 1920 addition and the construction of an addition at the rear of the main house as shown on plans dated 03/27/2014, finding that they generally meet the standards for issuance of a Landmark Alteration Certificate in Chapter 9-11-18, B.R.C. 1981, subject to the following conditions:.

- 1. The applicant shall be responsible for constructing the house in compliance with the approved plans dated 03/27/2014, except as modified by these conditions of approval.
- 2. Prior to submitting a building permit application and final issuance of the Landmark Alteration Certificate, the applicant shall submit revised designs that reduces the mass and scale of the addition when viewed from Pine St., 9th St. and the alley to ensure that it is subordinate to the historic portion of the house, with emphasis on reducing the portion to the east wall of the main house. This might require reduction of the square footage, roof mass and/or the height of the proposed addition.
- 3. Prior to submitting a building permit application and final issuance of the Landmark Alteration Certificate, the applicant shall submit the following, which shall be subject to the final review and approval of the Landmarks design review committee: revisions to the design to ensure that the fenestration of the addition that is publicly visible, is simpler than that on the main house by reducing the size of window and door openings and simplifying door and window design (submit window and door details), as well as wall materials, doors, siding material details, paint colors, roofing and any hardscaping on the property to ensure that the approval is consistent with the General Design Guidelines and the Mapleton Hill Historic District Guidelines and the intent of this approval.

- **K. Remley** considers the proposed square footage of the addition to be inappropriate for this property.
- D. Public hearing and consideration of a Landmark Alteration Certificate to construct a new two-car, 950 sq. ft. detached garage with an Owners Accessory Unit above at 420 Spruce St. in the Mapleton Hill Historic District, per section 9-11-18 of the Boulder Revised Code (HIS2014-00081). Applicant: Juana Gomez Owner: Luis and Julia Garza.

Board members were asked to reveal any ex-parte contacts they may have had on this item.

- M. Gerwing, N. Fiore, K. Snobeck, and K. Remley made site visits
- **M. Gerwing, K. Snobeck** and **N. Fiore** previously reviewed the Landmark Alteration Certificate application for the construction of the main house at a full board hearing
- M. Schreiner and L. May had no ex-parte contacts

Staff Presentation

J. Hewat made a PowerPoint presentation to the board and recommended that the Landmark Alteration Certificate application be approved with conditions.

Applicant's Presentation

Luis Garza, 420 Spruce St, spoke in support of landmark alteration certificate with staff's conditions, noting that he met with his neighbor to the west to address concerns about their view to the west.

Juana Gomez, 1127 Cranbrook Ct., architect, spoke in support of a Landmark Alteration Certificate.

Public Hearing

Peter Lapidis, 2029 5th St., has no objection to the garage and ADU and met with applicant to discuss impact of their views to the west. Considers height to be taller than most accessory buildings in the area, and disproportionally tall and requested a condition to reduce the building 5 feet in height.

Nicole Ward, 2029 5th St., spoke in general support of the staff's recommendation to reduce the building height and requested that the height be reduced 5 feet.

Abby Daniels, 1123 Spruce St., Historic Boulder, stated that the Preservation Committee agreed with staff's recommendation.

Motion

On a motion by **M. Gerwing**, seconded by **K. Snobeck**, the Landmarks Board approved (4-1, **K. Remley** objecting) the staff memorandum dated May 7th, 2014 as the findings of the Board and approve a Landmarks Alteration Certificate for the construction of a garage at 420 Spruce St. as shown on plans dated March 24, 2014, subject to the following conditions:

1. The applicant shall be responsible for ensuring that the development will be constructed in compliance with the application dated March 24, 2014 on file in the City of Boulder Community Planning and Sustainability Department, except as modified by these conditions of approval.

- 2. Prior building permit application and final issuance of the Landmark Alteration Certificate, the applicant shall submit revised plans for the proposed garage showing a reduction in height of the building of at least 3 to 5 feet so that it reads as a one-and-one half story building consistent with the General Design Guidelines for Boulder's Historic Districts and Individual Landmarks and the Mapleton Hill Design Guidelines.
- 3. Prior to submitting a building permit application and final issuance of the Landmark Alteration Certificate, the applicant shall submit the following: final details showing door and window details, roofing materials, railings, stairs, decking, siding, paving and proposed colors. These design details shall be reviewed and approved by the Landmarks design review committee, prior to the issuance of a building permit. The applicant shall demonstrate that the design details are in compliance with the intent of this approval and the General Design Guidelines and the Mapleton Hill Historic District Design Guidelines.
- **K.** Remley objected because she considers the height should be reduced by at least five feet.
- E. Public hearing and consideration of a Landmark Alteration Certificate to construct a one-and-a-half story, 715 sq. ft., two-car garage, remove a portion of the contributing garage, and construct a fence along the south and east property lines 730 Pine St. in the Mapleton Hill Historic District, per section 9-11-18 of the Boulder Revised Code (HIS2014-00087). Applicant: Will Hentschel Owner: Douglas and Jennifer Campbell.

Board members were asked to reveal any ex-parte contacts they may have had on this item.

M. Gerwing, N. Fiore, K. Snobeck and K. Remley made site visits

M. Schreiner and L. May had no ex-parte contacts

Staff Presentation

J. Hewat made a PowerPoint presentation to the board and recommended that the Landmark Alteration Certificate application be approved with conditions.

Applicant's Presentation

Jennifer Campbell, 730 Pine St., property owner, stated that she has met with **J. Hewat** and Brian Holmes, zoning administrator, to discuss zoning regulations and spoke in support of the Landmark Alteration Certificate application.

Public Hearing

Abby Daniels, 1123 Spruce St., Historic Boulder, stated that the Preservation Committee agreed with staff's recommendation to approve a Landmark Alteration Certificate with conditions. **Kathryn Barth**, 2949 20th St., supports retention of the contributing garage but is concerned with two-car garage along alley and considers that plate height on second story should be reduced. General concern about the general character of the alleys and having continuous walled in feeling.

J. Campbell stated that it is extremely difficult to meet owners' needs within the constraints of the guidelines and by keeping the existing garage, she requests that the board provide leeway in terms of the new accessory building.

Motion

On a motion by **K. Snobeck**, seconded by **N. Fiore**, the Landmarks Board approved (2-3, **M. Gerwing, K. Remley** and **M. Schreiner** objected) the staff memorandum dated May 7, 2014 as the findings of the Board and approve the application for a Landmarks Alteration Certificate for the removal of a portion of the contributing accessory building, construction of a garage not including fences at 730 Pine St. as shown on plans dated 03/27/2014, subject to the following conditions:

- 1. The applicant shall be responsible for ensuring that the development will be constructed in compliance with the application dated 03/27/2014 on file in the City of Boulder Community Planning and Sustainability Department, except as modified by these conditions of approval.
- 2. Prior building permit application and final issuance of the Landmark Alteration Certificate, the applicant shall submit revised plans for the proposed rear fence and gates to the Landmarks design review committee showing a reduction in height and widening space between board to at least 1" in a manner consistent with General Design Guidelines for Boulder's Historic Districts and Individual Landmarks and the Mapleton Hill Design Guidelines.
- 3. Prior building, permit application and final issuance of the Landmark Alteration Certificate, the applicant shall submit revised plans to remove fence from this approval.
- 4. Prior to submitting a building permit application and final issuance of the Landmark Alteration Certificate, the applicant shall submit the following: final details showing door and window details, roofing materials, railings, stairs, trellis including finish, decking, siding, paving, and proposed colors. These design details shall be reviewed and approved by the Landmarks design review committee, prior to the issuance of a building permit. The applicant shall demonstrate that the design details are in compliance with the intent of this approval and the General Design Guidelines and the Mapleton Hill Historic District Design Guidelines.
- **J. Campbell** withdrew the application and requested clear direction from the board. **M. Gerwing** considers that the mass and scale needs to be reduced to either a one-story, two car garage or a one-car, two-story garage. **M. Schreiner** considers this would meet his concerns. **K. Remley** does not consider a two-story solution appropriate.

F. Public hearing and consideration of a Landmark Alteration Certificate to construct a free-standing 355 sq. ft. building to provide American with Disabilities Act-compliant restrooms immediately west of the Chautauqua Auditorium at 900 Baseline Rd., in Chautauqua Park, per section 9-11-18 of the Boulder Revised Code (HIS2014-00089). Applicant: Jeff Medanich Owner: Colorado Chautauqua Association.

Board members were asked to reveal any ex-parte contacts they may have had on this item.

M. Gerwing and K. Snobeck attended a site meeting with the Landmarks Board in June 2013 K. Remely made a site visit

N. Fiore, M. Schreiner and L. May did not have ex-parte contacts.

Staff Presentation

J. Hewat made a PowerPoint presentation to the board and recommended that the Landmark Alteration Certificate application be approved with conditions.

Applicant's Presentation

Jeff Medanich, 2304 County Road West, Berthoud, Colorado Chautauqua Association, spoke about the collaborative effort of this proposal, including various city departments and the State Historic Fund. Six different locations were considered and this site was chosen as the best. He looks forward to working with the city on future projects at Chautauqua.

Public Hearing

Kathryn Barth, 2529 20th St., spoke about her attendance at one of the site visits and supports the proposed location and design.

Abby Daniels, 1123 Spruce St., Historic Boulder, stated that the Preservation Committee agreed with staff's recommendation to approve a Landmark Alteration Certificate.

Catherine Long-Gates, 3240 Broadway, president of Historic Boulder and co-owner of a Chautauqua cottage, supports the Landmark Alteration Certificate application and appreciated the collaborative and inclusive design process.

Bill Patterson, 7174 Paintbrush Trail, Chair of Colorado Chautauqua Association Board, spoke of design process and supports the application.

Motion

On a motion by **M. Gerwing**, seconded by **K. Remley**, the Landmarks Board approved (5-0) the application for the construction of new restroom building at the west side of the Chautauqua Auditorium, 900 Baseline Road as shown on plans dated 02/24/2014, finding that if constructed pursuant to the conditions below, it meets the standards for issuance of a Landmark Alteration Certificate in Section 9-11-18, B.R.C. 1981, and is consistent with the General Design Guidelines and the Chautauqua Park Historic District Design Guidelines, and adopts the staff memorandum dated May 7, 2014 as the findings of the Board.

1. The applicant shall be responsible for ensuring that the development will be constructed in compliance with the application dated 02/24/2014 on file in the City of Boulder Community Planning and Sustainability Department, except as modified by these conditions of approval.

2. Prior to submitting a building permit application and receiving final issuance of the Landmark Alteration Certificate, the applicant shall submit the following: final details showing door and window details, roofing materials, railings, stairs, decking, siding, paving and proposed colors. These design details shall be reviewed and approved by the Landmarks design review committee, prior to the issuance of a building permit. The applicant shall demonstrate that the design details are in compliance with the intent of this approval and the General Design Guidelines and the Chautauqua Park Historic District Design Guidelines.

6. MATTERS FROM THE LANDMARKS BOARD, PLANNING DEPARTMENT AND CITY ATTORNEY

- A. Officer Elections
 - a. **K. Snobeck** nominated **M. Gerwing** for chair. (5-0)
 - b. **M. Gerwing** nominated **K. Remley** for vice chair. (5-0)
- B. Update Memo
- C. Subcommittee Update
 - 1) Demolition Ordinance
 - 2) Outreach

8. ADJOURNMENT

Chairperson

- 3) Potential Historic Districts and Landmarks
- 4) Design Guidelines

7. DEBRIEF MEETING/CALENDAR CHECK

Approved on ______, 2014 Respectfully submitted,

The meeting adjourned at 11:06 p.m.